Status Report

ACD Working Group on Diversity (WGD)

Reed Tuckson, Co-Chair ACD WGD
Roderic I. Pettigrew, Acting COSWD and Co-Chair ACD WGD

December 5, 2013
Outline:

1. WGD Charge and Goals
2. Recap of ACD Recommendations & Actions
3. Three Extramural Diversity Initiatives
   • Common Fund
4. Three NIH-wide Diversity and Inclusion Initiatives
   • “In-House” programs
5. Next Steps
Charge to the ACD WGD

Charge: Provide regular advice to the ACD and NIH Director on effective strategies to increase the representation of diverse individuals underrepresented nationally in biomedical research and to reduce disparities in research awards from diverse applicants underrepresented nationally in biomedical research.

Goals:
1. Enhance access and opportunities for all, to foster a diverse scientific community.
2. Enrich the educational, mentoring, and scientific experience in the biomedical research training pipeline
3. Promote personal and professional growth for biomedical researchers underrepresented nationally in biomedical research
4. Foster mutual respect, valuing of differences, cross-cultural understanding and realization of the value of diversity in science
5. Advance programs that prepare diverse individuals underrepresented nationally as scientific leaders
ACD Recommendations

**PIPELINE:**

#3 additional financial support for undergraduates
#1 systematic review and evaluation of a diversity programs
#4 assess reason for disparity in grant awards
#6 establish working group of ACD to address #4
#2 develop interest in STEM in K-12 and beyond

**MENTORING:**

#5 establish a system of mentorship “networks”

**PEER REVIEW: (Dr. Richard Nakamura)**

#9 Text-based analysis of grant review commentaries
#10 Implicit bias/diversity awareness training for scientific review and program officers
#11 Design experiment to determine effects of application anonymization
#7 More detailed explanation for unscored grant applications

**INFRASTRUCTURE:**

#8 Establish bold, multi-year awards to enhance diversity at under-resourced institutions
#12 Appoint chief diversity officer and establish office of diversity
#13 More comprehensive search for tenure-track investigators (e.g., Stadtman search)
1. **Overarching goal:** Strengthen the NIH research enterprise through a more diverse and robust workforce, attracting talented individuals from all population sectors.

2. **Program goal:** Transformative approaches to engage individuals, especially those from underrepresented backgrounds, in biomedical research career paths, enhance persistence at all career stages, and prepare them to thrive.

3. A particular **emphasis is on undergraduates**, a key career point where students from underrepresented populations exit the pipeline.

4. Through an integrated set of initiatives, this program will **investigate what works and for whom**.

5. **Transformation** is expected to occur at awardee institutions, but larger impact will result from dissemination of lessons learned for nationwide adoption of effective strategies.
Extramural Grant #1
Common Fund

Building Infrastructure Leading to Diversity (BUILD)

To design and implement transformative, broad-based approaches to research education and training at comparatively under-resourced institutions with concentrations of students from disadvantaged backgrounds.

ACD Recommendations #2, 3, and 8
Building Infrastructure Leading to Diversity (BUILD)

- Award supports new and evidence-based approaches towards institutional, faculty and student development through efforts such as sustaining interest in research, increasing scholarly production, and enhancing pursuit of biomedical research.
- Recipients will test proposed novel, transformative interventions on an institution-wide level.
- Awardees will work with the consortium (BUILD, NRMN, CEC) to determine what works and for whom.

Eligibility

- Primary Institutions for BUILD: less than $7.5M in NIH RPG funding annually and at least 25% of undergraduate students receiving Pell grants.
- Primary Institutions will be encouraged (but not required) to form partnerships:
  - Research Partner Institutions -- research-intensive universities
  - Pipeline Partner Institutions -- two- or four-year colleges
  - Graduate/Medical Partner Institutions -- medical/graduate institutions without undergraduates but with a pool of doctoral-level applicants engaged in research and less than $7.5M in NIH RPG funding annually.

- Planning grants awarded in the Fall (~90 total applications); multi-year Funding Opportunity Announcements (FOAs) forthcoming.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PI Name</th>
<th>Institution Name</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BEAR, SUSAN ELIZABETH</td>
<td>PINE MANOR COLLEGE</td>
<td>Planning for BUILD at Pine Manor College</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOPIN, SUZZETTE F</td>
<td>TEXAS A&amp;M UNIVERSITY-CORPUS CHRISTI</td>
<td>Integrated Partnership for Education Training and Mentoring to the Doctorate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COLOM, LUIS V.</td>
<td>UNIV/TEXAS BROWNsville &amp; SOUTHMOST COL</td>
<td>BUILD - South Texas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRESPO, CARLOS J.</td>
<td>PORTLAND STATE UNIVERSITY</td>
<td>Enhancing Cross-disciplinary Infrastructure Training at Oregon (EXITO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D'AMOUR, GENE</td>
<td>Xavier University of Louisiana</td>
<td>Project ATTAIN: Increasing Participation of Xavier Students in the NIH Workforce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DODGE-FRANCIS, CAROLEE</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF NEVADA LAS VEGAS</td>
<td>Science &amp; Health: Ascertaining Research Education (SHARE) Consortium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECHEGOYEN, LOURDES</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS EL PASO</td>
<td>BUILDing SCHOLARS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGUILERA, RENATO J</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS EL PASO</td>
<td>Women of color Legacy Project (WCL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COLLINS, TIMOTHY WILLIAMS</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS EL PASO</td>
<td>BUILDing on UVI Success: A Creative Problem Solving Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRINESKI, SARAH</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF THE VIRGIN ISLANDS</td>
<td>BUILDing on UVI Success: A Creative Problem Solving Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MORERA, OSVALDO F</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF THE VIRGIN ISLANDS</td>
<td>BUILDing on UVI Success: A Creative Problem Solving Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JACKSON, KIMBERLY M</td>
<td>SPELMAN COLLEGE</td>
<td>Women of color Legacy Project (WCL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WINFIELD, LEYTE L</td>
<td>SPELMAN COLLEGE</td>
<td>Women of color Legacy Project (WCL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIMBIRD, LEE E.</td>
<td>FISK UNIVERSITY</td>
<td>Integrated Fisk STEM 3 YR Undergrad-2Yr Masters in CS- Vanderbilt Informatics PhD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROMANO, SANDRA</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF THE VIRGIN ISLANDS</td>
<td>BUILDing on UVI Success: A Creative Problem Solving Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SERVOSS, JULIE</td>
<td>FLORIDA ATLANTIC UNIVERSITY</td>
<td>RAISE UP- BUILD Planning Grant at Florida Atlantic University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMITH, MARY A</td>
<td>NORTH CAROLINA AGRI &amp; TECH ST UNIV</td>
<td>Innovative Strategies for URM Pipelines to Biomedical Research Careers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEVENS, DOUGLAS K</td>
<td>SALISH KOOTENAI COLLEGE</td>
<td>SKC-TCU Consortium BUILD Planning Grant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAYLOR, BARBRA ELAN</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF ALASKA FAIRBANKS</td>
<td>BUILDing Bridges in Alaska</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URIZAR, GUIDO G.</td>
<td>CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY LONG BEACH</td>
<td>Advancing Health Opportunities Research Alliance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
National Research Mentoring Network (NRMN)

To develop a networked set of skilled mentors from diverse disciplines linked to mentees across the country in robust mentoring relationships, develop best practices for mentoring, provide training opportunities for mentors, and establish standards through which mentoring efficacy can be assessed.

ACD Recommendations #1 and 8
National Research Mentoring Network (NRMN)

- Award supports evidence-based approaches towards developing effective mentoring
- Recipient will test these approaches on a large scale
- As standards evolve, awardee will work with the consortium (BUILD, NRMN, CEC) to determine what works and for whom.

- Connect students, postdoctoral fellows, and faculty to experienced mentors and network to the larger biomedical community
- Develop standards for and provide training in good mentorship
- Provide training in grantsmanship and career development skills
- Link with BUILD institutions; open to all student participants

Planning grants awarded in the Fall (~30 total applications); multi-year Funding Opportunity Announcements (FOAs) forthcoming.
# NRMN Planning Grant Awardees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PI Name</th>
<th>Institution Name</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BURGESS, DAVID (contact)</td>
<td>SOCIETY FOR THE ADV CHICANOS/NATIVE AMER (SACNAS)</td>
<td>Consortium for the National Research Mentoring Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WERNER-WASHBURNE, MARGRET C.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OKUYEMI, KOLAWOLE S</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA</td>
<td>Leveraging Best Practices in Mentoring from the Collective Experience of CNPCs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BYINGTON, CARRIE L (contact) FRIED, KAREN</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF UTAH</td>
<td>Clinical and Translational Science NRMN Furthering a Diverse Biomedical Workforce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAMUEL, RAYMOND, MD, PHD (contact) HARVEY, WILLIAM R MCGEE, ZINA THERES RAMSEY, CHENERE PIERCE</td>
<td>HAMPTON UNIVERSITY</td>
<td>The Hampton National Research Mentoring Network (NRMN) Consortium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WILSON, DONALD EDWARD</td>
<td>ASSOCIATION/ACADEMIC MINORITY PHYSICIANS</td>
<td>Mentoring Educating Networking Training Opportunities in Research Consortium (MEN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SORKNESS, CHRISTINE ANNE (contact) BRANCHAW, JANET L PFUND, CHRISTINE E</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN-MADISON</td>
<td>Strengthening Mentorship for a Diversified Biomedical Research Workforce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VISHWANATHA, JAMBOOR K</td>
<td>UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS HLTH SCI CTR</td>
<td>National STAR Fellowship Network</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Coordination and Evaluation Center (CEC)

To coordinate consortium-wide activities and evaluation of BUILD and NRMN programs. The CEC will also serve as the focal point for dissemination, sharing information with the broader biomedical research and training communities.

ACD Recommendations #5 and 8
Coordination and Evaluation Center (CEC)

- Awardee coordinates discussion of the hallmarks of success across the consortium (BUILD, NRMN, CEC)
- Coordination will occur in an iterative fashion allowing for information to be relayed to awardees in “real time”
- Proposed approaches can be modified to maximize efficacy based on this information

- Identify specific goals/metrics tailored to the individual environment of each awardee
- Assess the impact of approach used by each site
- Coordinate data acquisition across sites
- Disseminate consortium-endorsed practices and lessons learned to transform training and mentoring programs across the nation
NIH-Wide Diversity Program #1

Diversity at the NIH Workshop

• First-ever workshop presented directly to NIH senior leadership focused on diversity and inclusion.
  ➢ Opening Session with Institute/Center Directors and Scientific Directors.
Diversity at the NIH Workshop

AGENDA

• Understanding and Addressing Diversity
  ➢ David Williams, PhD, MPH, Harvard University

• Diversity as an Imperative for Excellence
  ➢ Daryl Smith, PhD, Claremont Graduate University

• Implicit Bias
  ➢ Brian Nosek, PhD, University of Virginia

• Evolution of Diversity
  ➢ Marc Nivet, EdD, Assoc. of Amer. Medical Colleges

• Stereotype Threat
  ➢ Hannah Valantine, MD, Stanford University

• Impostor Phenomenon
  ➢ Pauline Rose Clance, PhD

• Power and Social Relationships
  ➢ Jack Dovidio, PhD, Yale University

• Social Inequality
  ➢ Erin Cech, PhD, Rice University

• Diversity as a Fundamental Tenet of Innovation
  ➢ Joseph DeSimone, PhD, University North Carolina
Take-home Messages

Why Diversity Matters:

- “Since we learn the most from those we have the least in common with, diversity is a fundamental tenet of innovation.” ... “Diversity is core to driving the excellence we seek in basic science, clinical science”

Psychological Phenomena Counteractive to Diversity Goals

- Bias is a learned association. Once made, it becomes the default association making it difficult to change even with awareness.
- Psychosocial phenomenon (e.g., stereotype threat, impostor phenomenon) can influence perceptions and social interactions that interfere with enhancing diversity.
- “Legitimize diversity and inequality issues as topics of conversation around the NIH; bracketing these conversations to spaces and times designated as for "diversity" will do little to change culture or practice.”

ACTION ITEM: NIH Institute/Center Directors charged with identifying challenges and potential solutions to overcome those challenges in efforts to diversify our workforce
NIH-Wide Diversity Program #2

WISER Survey

DECEMBER 2013

• Working towards creating an Inclusive and Supportive Environment for Research survey launched Dec. 1.

• Goal is to collect information from the entire NIH workforce.

• The WISER survey topic areas include personal success, diversity and inclusion, the work environment, and mentoring at the NIH.

“Workforce diversity and inclusion is vital to the success of NIH to achieve scientific outcomes that advance the nation’s health.”
— DR. FRANCIS COLLINS

LINK TO SURVEY

WISER.nih.gov
GOAL: Define mentoring, sponsorship, advocacy and other related concepts to establish a reference working model of good mentorship. Identify successes and gaps in the mentoring infrastructure of the NIH with the intent of establishing interventions or strategies to improve the mentoring and sponsorship. [SPRING FY14]

QUESTIONS to address:

• How do you define mentor, sponsor, advocate, champion, coach?
• What data/evidence exist for supporting various approaches?
• How do psychosocial phenomenon impact mentoring?
• What interventions can be implemented?
Next Steps for the ACD WGD

• Through the ACD, the WGD will continue discussions on:
  – How best to communicate the goals and intent of the Common Fund Diversity Program (i.e., BUILD, NRMN, CEC) to the applicant pool and work with institutions to develop strong, transformative programs
  – Construct of the Workshop on Mentoring
  – In-house efforts to enhance diversity
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date Range</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>June 2012</td>
<td>ACD Report on Diversity: 13 Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June – September 2012</td>
<td>NIH Pre-Implementation Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 2012</td>
<td>NIH Leadership Retreat: Pre-Implementation Plans presented &amp; discussed with Senior Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October - December 2012</td>
<td>NIH Implementation Plans revised, reviewed by leadership and presented at ACD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 2013</td>
<td>Dr. Collins Accepts Plans, executes <strong>Recommendation #12</strong> to establish new position in his office: Chief Officer for Scientific Workforce Diversity (COSWD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 2013</td>
<td>Dr. Pettigrew appointed Acting COSWD &amp; Co-Chair Search Committee for COSWD search process begins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 2013</td>
<td>Planning Grants Applications Received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 2013</td>
<td>Planning Grants Applications Stage 1 review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 2013</td>
<td>NIMHD Council Stage 2 review/Approved list of Awards: 15 BUILD &amp; 7 NRMN Planning Grants awarded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2013</td>
<td>Shutdown delayed BUILD, NRMN, &amp; CEC Full Multi-year Award FOAs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 2013</td>
<td>Planned Release of FOAs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March/April 2014</td>
<td>Applications for Full Awards due</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 2014</td>
<td>Awards: ~10 BUILD; 1 NRMN ; 1 CEC will be made; total of ~$50 M/year up to 10 years BUILD: support novel programs, students &amp; faculty, at under-resourced institutions; partnerships with research intensive institution (Rec #2,3,8 ) NRMN: assemble a single nationwide consortium of mentors to support BUILD and other scholars (Rec #5,8) CEC: facilitate integration of BUILD &amp; NRMN; evaluate performance; effect synergy with other NIH programs (Rec #1,8); disseminate novel approaches to training community <a href="https://commonfund.nih.gov/diversity/overview.aspx">https://commonfund.nih.gov/diversity/overview.aspx</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Biomedical Research: Strength from Diversity

Dr. Collins continues to provide leadership on the urgency of diversity and inclusion in the biomedical research workforce.

authored by Wilder, Tabak, Pettigrew and Collins.
Members of ACD Working Group on Diversity

Reed Tuckson
Co-Chair

Roderic Pettigrew
Co-Chair

Rosina Becerra
UCLA

Sangeeta Bhatia
MIT

Frank Douglas
Austen BioInnovation Institute

Mike Drake
UC Irvine

Santa Ono
Univ. of Cincinnati

Joan Reede
Harvard

John Ruffin
NIMHD, NIH

Scout
Fenway Institute

Abigail Stewart
Univ. of Michigan

Dana Takagi
UC Santa Cruz

Clyde Yancy
Nortwestern Univ.